

# Table of Contents

<b>Index of Tables and Figures</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>Glossary of Terms</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>8</b>
Setting the Context.....	9
Defining Healthcare: .....	10
Healthcare Policies: .....	11
Healthcare in India: .....	12
Healthcare and Neo-liberal times:.....	15
The case of healthcare workers: .....	17
The Case of West Bengal:.....	20
Healthcare during the pandemic:.....	20
Planning of Chapters: .....	21
<b>Chapter 1: Literature Review</b> .....	<b>25</b>
1.1 Statement of the Problem: .....	26
1.2 Literature Review: .....	26
1.2.1 Politics, Policies and Healthcare: .....	27
1.3 Healthcare Provision and the Case of Careworkers: .....	40
1.4 The Indian Scenario: .....	47
1.4.1 Different types of welfarism:.....	48
1.4.2 Welfarism and Healthcare Policies in Neoliberal Times: .....	49
1.4.3 The case of careworkers: .....	53
<b>Chapter 2: Research Questions, Methodology and Introducing the Case Study</b> .....	<b>60</b>
2.1 Research Gap: .....	60
2.2 Aims and Objectives: .....	60
2.3 Research Area: .....	61
2.4 Research Questions: .....	62
2.5 Methodology: .....	62
2.5.1 An experience before the outbreak of COVID-19 Pandemic in Kolkata, West Bengal:.....	66
2.5.2 Data Collection Methods:.....	67
2.5.3 Sample: .....	70

2.6 Locating West Bengal: .....	71
<b>Chapter 3: Understanding Healthcare Policies of India .....</b>	<b>78</b>
3.1 Healthcare in pre-colonial India: .....	78
3.2 Healthcare After Independence till Emergency: .....	82
3.3 Years of Political Turmoil and Run-up to liberalisation: .....	87
3.4 Post-liberalisation India till 2015: .....	91
3.5 Factors impacting healthcare in India and solutions through policies: .....	97
3.6 Universal Health Coverage: .....	103
3.7 Where to from here?.....	105
<b>Chapter 4: The Scenario in West Bengal.....</b>	<b>107</b>
4.1 Looking Back: .....	107
4.2 Scene After Independence:.....	111
4.2 The Left Front Era:.....	118
4.2.1 Short Comparison between Kerala and West Bengal:.....	120
4.3 1990s and the liberalisation of the economy:.....	121
4.3.1 The Case of Hakim Sheikh:.....	124
4.4 New Millennium: .....	127
4.5 2011: Change of Power:.....	131
4.5.1 Is Healthcare a Political Issue in West Bengal? .....	133
4.6 Snapshot I: Survey in Urban Slums: .....	138
4.7 Snapshot 2: Tea Gardens of Jalpaiguri and Alipurduar: .....	142
4.8 Charlands of Murshidabad: .....	143
<b>Chapter 5: The Realities of Nurses.....</b>	<b>148</b>
5.1 Early developments: .....	149
5.2 Post-independence developments: .....	152
5.3 1990s onwards:.....	158
5.4 <i>Ora/Aamra</i> (Them/Us):.....	161
5.5 In Search of Dignity: The Case of Contractual Nurses in Rural Areas of West Bengal: .....	167
5.6 The Search for Dignity Continues: Nurses in the Private Sector:.....	169
5.7 The heterogeneous private sector:.....	172
5.8 The Reality of Nurses' Migration: .....	174
5.9 Duties and responsibilities of nurses:.....	177
5.9.1 Patient Care and Ward Related Duties and Responsibilities:.....	177
5.9.2 Supervisory work:.....	178

5.9.3 Duties and Responsibilities of Nurses Regarding OT, ICU and other such units:	178
5.9.4 Education and Training Related Work: .....	179
5.10 Responses: .....	180
5.11 Collective Claim Making: .....	181
5.12 Towards Dignity? .....	183
<b>Chapter 6: <i>Ayahs</i>: The Underbelly of Care Economy .....</b>	<b>186</b>
6.1 The Beginning: .....	188
6.2 The situation now: .....	189
6.3 <i>Ayahs</i> and <i>Ayah</i> Centres: .....	194
6.3.1 Up Close and Personal: .....	194
6.3.2 Up Close and Distant: .....	198
6.4 Responses: .....	204
6.5 Perception of the clients: .....	205
6.6 Pandemic and the <i>Ayahs</i> : .....	206
6.7 Negotiating society, State and the Pandemic: .....	208
6.8 New hierarchies: .....	209
6.9 Why are <i>Ayahs</i> relevant? .....	210
6.10 Role of Agency: .....	211
6.11 Is it a journey from informalization to some form of proto- formalization? .....	213
6.12 Wrapping up: .....	214
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>215</b>
<b>Select Bibliography .....</b>	<b>227</b>
<b>Annexure .....</b>	<b>255</b>

## Index of Tables and Figures

Table 1: Top 3 countries in South-east Asia, availing maximum services of private medical providers .....	16
Table 2: The proportion of medical personnel to the population in India (before 1947) .....	18
Table 3: Pros and Cons of Case Study Method .....	65
Table 4: West Bengal’s demographic profile over 1991 and 2011, and comparison with India .....	71
Table 5: Life expectancy in West Bengal and India .....	73
Table 6: Health Parameters of West Bengal and India .....	74
Table 7: Rural Health Infrastructure under the Sixth Five-Year Plan .....	90
Table 8: Health Care Expenditure by Government of India .....	91
Table 9: Data on healthcare workers .....	95
Table 10: Deaths per month between 1826 and 1832.....	108
Table 11: Types of Institutions before Independence.....	111
Table 12: Expenditure by State and Central Governments.....	123
Table 13: Allocation of Additional Central Assistance (in Rs. crores) for the Basic Minimum Services Programme to West Bengal.....	126
Table 14: Availability of healthcare workers in West Bengal and India .....	134
Table 15: Other categories of healthcare workers .....	134
Table 16: Total number of Medical Institutions in West Bengal.....	135
Table 17: Data regarding Hospitals, sub-centres, Doctors, Nurses and Others in the Tea Gardens .....	142
Table 18: Pay pattern of contractual and regular nurses.....	159
Table 19: Sample of responses .....	180
Table 20: Earning of ayahs in Kolkata .....	203
Figure 1: Average govt. hospital beds per 1000 population in India, 2019, Source: Singh, Ravi and Chakraborty (2020).....	76
Figure 2: Flowchart of responsibility as per Ninth Five Year Plan (done by researcher) .....	92
Figure 3: Responses regarding areas requiring improvement.....	139
Figure 4: Responses from 2 urban slums.....	140
Figure 5: Responses from the Slums about healthcare perceptions.....	141
Figure 6: Healthcare Service Preference.....	141
Figure 7: Healthcare Perceptions in Tea Gardens, Charlands and among service seekers in urban hospitals (government) .....	145
Figure 8: Healthcare Service Preference.....	145

# List of Abbreviations

ANM- Auxiliary Nursing Midwifery

ASHA- Accredited Social Health Activist

AYUSH- Ayurveda, Yoga and Naturopathy, Unani, Siddha and Homeopathy

CGFNS- Commission of Graduates of Foreign Nursing Schools

CHS- Community Health Centre

COPD- Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease

CPI- Communist Party of India

CPI(M)- Communist Party of India (Marxist)

EPF- Employee Provident Fund

FPS- Family Pension Scheme

FR- Fertility Rates

FYP- Five Year Plan

GDP-Gross Domestic Product

GOI- Government of India

GoWB- Government of West Bengal

GNM- General Nursing and Midwifery

HDI- Human Development Index

HDR- Human Development Report

HLEG- High Level Expert Group

HSR- Health Sector Reforms

ICMR- Indian Council of Medical Research

INC- Indian Nursing Council

IMS- Indian Medical Service

IMF- International Monetary Fund

IMR- Infant Mortality Rate

LMICs - Low- and middle-income countries

MMR- Maternal Mortality Rate

MNP- Minimum Needs Programme  
NGOs- Non-government organizations  
NSSO- National Sample Survey Organisation  
NHP- National Health Policy  
NPC- National Planning Committee  
NRHM- National Rural Health Mission  
PHA- Public Health Assembly  
PHC- Primary Health Centre  
PHM- Public Health Movement  
PRI- Panchayati Raj Institutions  
RSBY- Rastra Swasthya Bima Yojna  
SAP- Structural Adjustment Programmes  
SNC- State Nursing Council  
TOEFL- Test of English as a Foreign Language  
TNAI- Trained Nurses Association of India  
UHC- Universal Health Coverage  
UN- United Nations  
UNICEF- United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund  
UPA- United Progressive Alliance  
USSR- Union of Soviet Socialist Republics  
WB- World Bank  
WBNC- West Bengal Nursing Council  
WDR- World Development Report  
WfH- Wages for Housework  
WHO- World Health Organisation

# Glossary of Terms

*Boddi*- Indigenous medicine practitioner.

*Char/charland*- Sandbars that emerge as islands within the river channel.

*Dada*- Elder brother.

*Dai/dhai*- Wet nurse.

*Diar*- Another name for *char*.

*Didi*- Elder sister.

*Jaributi*- Medicinal herbs and roots.

*Kobiraj*- Indigenous medicine practitioner, mainly referring to practitioners of Ayurveda.

*Kobiraji*- Ayurvedic medicine

*Mashi*-Maternal aunt.

*Ojha*- Witch doctor.

*Paschim* -West

*Purba*- East

*Totka*- Home remedies